

To Accreditation Council  
Of Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
And Quality Assurance  
In Higher Education and Health Care

04.03.2022

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
BASED ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME  
7R01108 – “ENDOCRINOLOGY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN”  
NEI "KAZAKHSTANSKO-RUSSIYSKIY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"  
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF  
RESIDENCY) OF MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

**external expert evaluation period: 16 – 18 February 2022**

**almaty, 2022**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions	7
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"	
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of the residency under educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit Programme	

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
GPA	Weighted average assessment of the level of educational achievements of the student in the chosen specialty
ECTS	The European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team-Based Learning
AIS	Automated Information System
BD	Basic disciplines (training)
EEC	External Expert Commission
HEI	Higher education institution
SAC	State Certification Commission
CCH	City Clinical Hospital
Civil defense and emergency situations	Civil defense and emergencies
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DLT	Distance Learning Technologies
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care
FSA	Final State Attestation
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IEP	Individual Curriculum (Resident)
CVI	Coronavirus infection
CC	Component of choice
CEP	Committee for Educational Programmes
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
NEI "KRMU"	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
MoH of RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MJ of RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
RRW	Resident research work
NCIE	National Centre for Independent Examination
SC	Science Center
FLS	Fundamentals of life safety
EP	Educational programme
MT	Midterm
PD	Profiling disciplines (training)
PHC	Primary health care
TS	Teaching staff
RSE on REM	Republican State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management
WC	Work Curricula
QMS	Quality Management System

SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
IWR	Independent work of resident
IWRs	Independent work of the resident
SC	Simulation Center
IWRT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TEP	Typical educational plan
ERWR	Educational and research work of residents
EMA	Educational and methodological association
SC	Scientific Council
ACC	Alumni Career Center
SPE	School of Pedagogical Excellence

## 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 02 dated 02.02.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" in the period from 16 to 18 February 2022, as follows:

<b>№ п/п</b>	<b>Status as part of EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty</b>
1	chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NEI "Surgical Association of Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society
2	Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Scientific Work, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course of Forensic Medicine St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law. Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	National Academic expert, MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with Neonatology of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov"
5	Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Public Health NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov", trainer for training of the Oshi of the Western region.
6	Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of dermatovenerology and cosmetology NJSC Semey Medical University
7	Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatimya Ilyasovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases No.1 of NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov".
8	Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna	anesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the Department of Postgraduate Education South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC.
9	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, doctor – pediatrician of the highest category, director of the Department of Academic Work of

			Semey Medical University NJSC.
10	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine, Semey Medical University.
11	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich	Head of the Department of Traumatology and Orthopedics NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU"
12	Kazakh Academic Expert	Eltai Utemuratovich Rakhmanov	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Degree in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, Instructor, School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, organizer of educational, practical and research work of undergraduates in sports medicine and rehabilitation
13	Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva,	Deputy Chief Physician for Children IDP City Polyclinic No.29
14	Resident Representative	Ermekbai Aibek Amanzholuly,	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including pediatric" NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU"

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the ECAQA (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017). The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme "Endocrinology for adults, children" and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, bin	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants Executive body – Rector Control body – Audit Commission Collegiate body – Academic Council
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created on	1992 y.
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010

Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Year 2021
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	11 graduates transferred from KazMUNO
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	15 trainees
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	5/1, 50%

The University develops its activities through the Strategic Development Plan of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (long-term) (<http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/>) and the Tactical Plan for the implementation of the strategy (academic year), which are discussed and approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University with the participation of stakeholders.

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational programmes of the residency. In 2021, there was the first set of residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children".

The educational programme of the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" is aimed at training specialists who are able to meet the needs of society in the provision of medical care, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, use the achievements of information and communication technologies, strengthen public health.

In accordance with the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No. KR DSM – 43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programmes", the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" was renamed to 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children".

Studying in the residency in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" is carried out on a full-time basis, the term of study is 2 years.

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" is carried out in multidisciplinary medical clinics and form a patient-centered style of work aimed at ensuring the safety of patients, their correct identification, effective communication, improving the safety of examination and treatment, reducing injuries, compliance with successive treatment.

Training in the residency goes with a focus on practice, so theoretical training is 10%, clinical work 75%, independent work 15%.

As a result of training, the resident in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" receives a holistic vision of the processes of the doctor's work.

As part of the Bologna process, the university has introduced elements of institutional autonomy.

The programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children", developed within the framework of the SCES of the residency (the discussion of the SCES and the 2020 residency tuples was held at the EMA meeting in the direction of training – Health care on June 19, 2019 No.5.) and the Qualification Characteristics of a Doctor (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of health care workers") took into account the main final results of the resident's training.

## 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

The start of the implementation of the accredited educational programme in 2021, as this programme undergoes initial accreditation.

## 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme "Endocrinology of Adults, Children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme "Endocrinology of Adults, Children" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on 101 pages of the main text, 13 annexes on 24 pages, copies or electronic versions of 19 documents located at <http://medkrmu.kz/>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" Dr. med., Professor Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 6 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee:

1. Bazarbekova R.B., Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Endocrinology;
2. Yelemesova M.T., Director of the Department of Financial Work of the KRMU
3. Kasimova S.Yu., Head of the Administrative and Legal Department
4. Verevkina V.I., Head of HR Department of KRMU
5. Olzhabaev S.T., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the State Enterprise on PHC "Almaty Regional Oncology Dispensary"
6. Toreyeva Sh.Kh., resident doctor in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children", 2nd year of study

The self-assessment of the educational programme of the educational programme of the residency 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of order No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On the establishment of a working group for conducting a specialized self-assessment and writing a report".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert: Kudabayeva Khatima Ilyasovna, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

Standards	Reviewer's recommendations
1	Section 1.3.2 It is necessary to indicate what measures are taken in case of detection of any violations of professional behavior, non-compliance with the Code of Honor by employees.
2	Section 2.1.5 Of the training methodologies presented, which are the most appropriate to use for training residents to achieve key competencies? Section 2.4.2 In the specialty "Adult Endocrinology, Pediatric", how often is the list of elective disciplines updated? How has the subject of electives changed during the reporting period? Section 2.5.2 Does the ratio of 1:3 of the number of teaching staff and the number of students in the specialty remain? Section 2.6.1 Describe in more detail the process of training and control of residents in the workplace... (p. 38 of the self-report).



3	Section 3.1.4. Does the department analyze the strength of the acquired knowledge, their "survival" in the learning process? 3.1.4 Is there an external review of the instruments in the specialty 7R01108 – Endocrinology for adults, children, when the reviewers are employees of external organizations, associations or employers. Section 3.2.2 Provide forms and methods of summary assessment on the example of a separate discipline
4	Section 4.1.9 From the self-report: "Persons with seniority and experience in combating coronavirus infection in medical organizations of the country receive the preemptive right upon enrollment...". Whether equality of rights to quality education is violated, including for special groups (e.g. persons with disabilities). Section 4.1.9 From the self-report "Assessment of knowledge based on the point-rating system, taking into account all forms of activity – scientific, educational, etc. – ...". How is scientific activity assessed?
5	Section 5.2.1. What is the duration and frequency of training of clinical mentors in practical health care? Section 5.1.1 How is the balance between pedagogical, scientific and clinical activities of teaching staff maintained?
6	Section 6.1.1 How is the safety of resident endocrinologists at clinical sites ensured in the context of a pandemic? Section 6.1.2 Do residents have access to electronic patient databases (Damumed. Avicenna) to achieve learning objectives. Section 6.3 Did the faculty of the department train resident endocrinologists in additional training in distance learning technologies? Section 6.3 In what cases were resident endocrinologists trained online?
7	Section 7.1.2. Is the resident's R&D competencies assessed? If so, how.
8	There are no recommendations.
9	There are no recommendations.

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

In all standards, the real practice of the NEI "KRMU" for the training of residents in the specialty "Endocrinology for adults, children" is given, taking into account the beginning of student admission in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and Annexes contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### 3. Description of the external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology of Adults, Children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care» No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed by the Rector of the KRMU Professor N. Dzhynakbayev.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 9 people;
- interviews with residents – 277 people in total study of the [website http://medkrmu.kz/](http://medkrmu.kz/);
- interviewing 43 teachers;
- questionnaires for teachers and residents - 113 and 200, respectively;
- observation of resident training: attendance at a practical lesson on the topic "Modern approaches to the therapy of type 2 diabetes mellitus" by Professor Bazarbekova R.B. with residents of the groups: Endocrinologist (End.) 21-01, End 21-02, End 21-03 on the basis of the City Clinical Hospital (CCH) No.7 of Almaty
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visited the practice/clinical engagement bases of the City Clinical Hospital No.7 in Almaty, where training is conducted on the educational programme "Endocrinology for adults, children" with the participation of 6 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 19 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members**

<b>№</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Job Title</b>
1	Bazarbekova Rimma Bazarbekovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department
2	Svetlana Usikovna Kazaryan	lecturer of the department
3	Ermakhanova Tamara Ozbekbayevna	Senior Lecturer of the Department
4	Bektayeva Inabat Seitkasymovna	Graduate of 2019. Head of the endocrinology department of the State Clinical Hospital No.7 in Almaty
5	Azizova Zarina Maratovna	Residents in the specialty "Endocrinology for adults, children"
6	Bayken Saniya Tandykovna	
7	Aibek Galimovich Dzhumagaliyev	
8	Zhumabayeva Saule	
9	Izbasar ulzhan Mukhtarkyzy	
10	Kulaeva Suzana Nurmakhamedovna	
11	Musaeva Sabina Demiyonovna	

12	Zim ulia Seidalykyzy	
13	Seitkozhanova Aiym Zhanatkalikyzy	
14	Sandybayeva (Serikbayeva) Gulmira Narmukhamadovna	
15	Baymetova Sevara Kulmatovna	
16	Erlankyzy Kalamkas	
17	Toreeva Shakhnoza Khamidullakyzy	
18	Thurar Mady Kairatuly	

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (Committee of educational programmes, Academic Council, etc.), in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period of 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as: "Mission, Vision and Values", "Market Analysis", "2 SWOT Analysis", "Benchmarking", "Accreditation of Competitors", "Risks", "Strategic Goals", "Indicators of Strategic Development", which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson "Modern approaches to the therapy of type 2 diabetes» with residents of 1 year of training, we received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, the residents respond to tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve their skills in the specialty. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of academic honesty (27.04.2019) and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

While attending a practical lesson on the topic "Modern approaches to the therapy of type 2 diabetes mellitus", in the amount of 2 hours and talking with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

The study of control and measuring instruments (100 tests, 30 tasks, 25 questions for the midterm control in the discipline "Adult endocrinology in the hospital" showed that the organization has introduced an appropriate evaluation policy that allows a multifaceted assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, the assessment of night duty and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document (Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge dated August 29, 2019 (PL-03-35-10), Regulation on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students dated August 29, 2019 (PL-03-35-11) and during the work of the organization

of education, there were no precedents for appeal. Thus, compliance with **standard 3 has been established.**

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with the senior lecturer of the Department of Endocrinology, Ermakhanova Tamara Ozbekbayevna, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual individual and departmental plans, annual reports, regulations of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents: syllabuses, lecture material on the discipline and information on the schedules of classes, holding of organizational meetings, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with Svetlana Usikovna Kazaryan, a lecturer at the department.

The conversation with the head of the department Bazarbekova Rimma Bazarbekovna included such questions as: "How are clinical mentors involved in the educational process?", "Do clinical mentors participate in the assessment of knowledge during oral examinations, midterm controls?", "Is the rotation of residents on clinical bases carried out? What is the frequency?". The information received allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (2 people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since part of part-time teachers are not well versed in teaching methods.

Interviews with 6 teachers, including 5 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with **standard 4.**

In order to verify the data of **Standard 5**, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation. At the moment, the department performs research work on the topic "Assessment of the state of carbohydrate metabolism and kidney function in hospitalized patients with ACS" funded by the pharmaceutical company "Boehringer Ingelheim"), which involves faculty and residents. A scientific study on the topic "Clinical and genetic aspects of CDAC due to 21-hydroxylase deficiency" is being carried out proactively. According to the results of scientific works, articles and abstracts are published.

During visits to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with **Standard 6**, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time to supervise patients, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time,

residents would like more independence in the management of patients, the conduct of international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding. Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaires of residents).

The conversation with the employer - chief physician of the State Clinical Hospital No.7 of Almaty Manas Ramazanov and deputy chief physician Sheriyazdan Zhadyra Slamovna of the State Clinical Hospital No.7 was held offline and included such issues as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities. The main clinical base of the Department of Endocrinology was visited. City Clinical Hospital No.7 of Almaty is today considered one of the largest medical institutions not only in the city, but also in the whole country. Now the hospital has more than 30 structural units, including 19 clinical and 9 paraclinical ones.

The employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. The hospital is the clinical base of 17 departments of leading medical scientific centers and universities of Kazakhstan. She has reached a high level and deservedly takes her place in the market of medical services. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. There are 3 departments of surgery, a center of neurosurgery, hematology, endocrinology, cardiology, traumatology, urology, two departments of gynecology, a department of nephrology, hemodialysis, orthosurgery, therapy, radiation diagnostics, consulting and rehabilitation department, etc. The clinic has the largest intensive care unit. Residents – endocrinologists have full access to all departments of the clinic, participate in consultations, supervise and advise patients with endocrine pathology in all departments of the clinic.

Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher, and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, interviews, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01108 – Endocrinology for adults, children" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. No comments were made by the members of the EEC (if any, please write). Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 (five) years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:** Recommendations of the ECAQA EEC on the results of an external evaluation of educational programmes in the specialties of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University.

**General recommendations:**

1. Introduce the fundamentals of the manager of scientific research into the educational programme.
2. Expand the list of elective disciplines in the specialty.
3. The committee of the organization's testology shall establish the analysis and evaluation of test tasks.
4. Expand the representation of resident associations and organizations in the process of receiving residents.

**4. Results of the survey.**

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on the resource <https://webanketa.com/> between 16.02 and 18.02.2022.

**The resident survey includes 22 questions.** In total 200 people answered, from them took part: residents of the 1st year of training - 51,5%; the 2nd year of training - 33,5%; 3, 4th year of training - 11,5%; graduates - 3,5%. The vast majority of residents (more than 80%) answered positively to questions concerning creation of conditions in the process of acquisition of knowledge and skills (conditions and equipment of classrooms, auditoriums; conditions for rest and meals; access to electronic educational resources, etc.). A high percentage of students noted their involvement in the work of advisory bodies; awareness of students' problems related to training; arranges a schedule of training sessions in disciplines. 87,5% of respondents will recommend to study in this organization of education to the acquaintances, friends, relatives.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. A total of 113 people responded, of whom 58.41% teach in the residency. Pedagogical experience: up to 5 years – 28.32%, up to 10 years - 22.12%, more than 10 years - 49.56%. More than 70% of respondents indicated satisfaction with the provision of resources (classrooms, equipment); support in the implementation of scientific work (publication activity, participation in conferences). High satisfaction with the work of the HR service (personnel); the opportunity for career growth and the development of the teacher's competencies; compliance with ethics and subordination in the team; the organization of the educational process was noted. On the question "Are social support programmes for teachers implemented in the educational organization?" only 38.94 per cent responded positively and 44.25 per cent were unaware of this.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes, including in the specialty "Endocrinology of adults, children".

**The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions.** In total 113 people (in total in the staff 484) answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – at 28,3%, till 10 years – 22,1%, more than 10 years – 49,6%.

74.34% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 22.12% are partially satisfied. The university observes ethics and subordination, 86.73% completely agree, 11.5% partially. Fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 75.22% of respondents, partly 23%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence to teachers, completely agree – 70,8%, partially – 22,12%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research – 75.22% completely agree, 16.8% partially. 83.2% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel service, and 13.3% are partially satisfied. Half of those surveyed underwent further training during the year. Only 81.4% fully agree that they can be

implemented as professionals, and 13.3% partially. Unfortunately, 33.6% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in the participation of International and Republican events, and 30.97% did not address this question to the leadership. Most of the respondents 73.45% completely agree, and 22.1% partially agree that the disciplines are provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment). 38.9% are unaware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and doubt their availability 10.6% of respondents. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers – 65.5%, sometimes 18.6% of respondents. Various teaching methods are used in the education of students, but most often the analysis of situational tasks is used (75.2%), oral surveys (61%), less often they rewrite thematic information from a monograph (10.6%). 70.8% fully agree that this survey will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 14.2% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire presented in the Attachment generally demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time determine areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, support for teachers in terms of improving their professional competence, support for teachers in terms of participation in International and Republican conferences, support for both students and teachers in academic mobility).

## **5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

The mission of the educational programme (EP) in the specialty 7R01108 "Endocrinology for adults, children" is aimed at implementing the mission, aimed at training specialists who are able to meet the needs of society in the provision of medical care, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, use the achievements of information and communication technologies, strengthen public health. The main aspect of the declared mission of the educational programme is the study of the need for practical health care in specialists and their effective system of professional training.

##### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

The development of professionalism and promotes the professional autonomy necessary for a health professional. The results of training in 12 disciplines of the mandatory component (90% of 9 disciplines) and 1 discipline of the component of choice are implemented\ WB-5 – Safety and quality, in 7 disciplines of the mandatory component (70% of 10 disciplines) develop WB-6 – Public health and 1 discipline of the component of choice, 9 disciplines of the mandatory component (90% of 10 disciplines) and 1 discipline of the component of choice are included in the treasure in the development of WB-6 – Training and development. Also, 10 of the 12 disciplines implement WB 1, 2, 3. This moment, just creates.

Staff autonomy derives from the possibility of internal and external search for candidates for a vacant post. Internal search provides the ability to use the personnel reserve in the first place. Further multi-level selection system contributes to the effective selection of personnel by professional, business, moral qualities using modern technologies (Personnel Policy of the NEI "KRMU" (25.12.2020). Experienced employees and mentors working on clinical bases are involved in working with residents.

Thus, the Department of Endocrinology has an EP that meets the requirements of the SCES, is staffed with employees with clinical experience and scientific titles, training is carried out on the basis of multidisciplinary clinics, i.e. there are sufficient resources for training residents of endocrinologists.

### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

In the EP for the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children", developed within the framework of the SCES of the residency (discussion of the SCES and WC of the residency in 2020 was held at the meeting of the EMA in the direction of training – Health care on June 19, 2019 No.5.) and the Qualification Characteristics of a Doctor (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of health care workers"), the main final results of the resident's training were taken into account.

As a result of training, the resident in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" receives a holistic vision of the processes of the doctor's work. For example, a resident under the supervision of a supervisor / mentor receives special knowledge, trains practical skills. The EP presents the list of practical skills recommended by the SCES, their number and the level of implementation of the training results.

text

### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

Employers receive information about the results of training when working as mentors at clinical bases. The course receives feedback on residents when surveying employers.

Since the EP is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market, coordination of the elements of the EP, CED is carried out with employers (order for the composition of the CEP No. 26-02-15-n/k dated 28.08.2020). Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of the EP, participation in the discussion of the results at the meetings of the CEP, scientific and practical meetings of the University. During the discussion, proposals for further improvement of the strategy and tactics of training in the residency are formed, which allows timely development of action plans to eliminate shortcomings. Thus, at the meeting of the CEP dated 24.09.2020 No.2, an action plan was approved to improve the organization of the educational process in the residency. The Academic Policy of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" for the 2020-2021 academic year defines the academic policy of the university, issues of academic mobility, on-site training of interns and residents (regulations on on-site training in internship and residency, approved by the decision of the Academic Council dated August 29, 2019, Minutes No. 1.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

*Standard 1: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.*

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **2.1 Postgraduate programme framework**

The educational process at the university is organized in accordance with the "Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education" (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011 No.152). Credit technology involves increasing the responsibility of students for the learning process. In the NEI "KRMU", a model for the competence of residents was developed, prescribed in the EP and approved at the meeting of the University Council (Minutes No.10 dated June 19, 2019).

All conditions of training are provided by systemic, continuous content, consistent development of all competencies, depending on the specialty, takes into account the logic of academic interrelation of disciplines, their continuity. The model of the educational programme based on the established learning outcomes of residents and the qualifications they receive is also ensured by the transparency of training. Residents and teachers are informed about the necessary competencies that both students



and teachers acquire. This takes place in a context of transparency and awareness of the successes of the residents.

The structure and content of the EP comply with the requirements of the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020, approved by Order No.647 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in accordance with the name of the programme and specialty. According to the classifier, the specialty is legitimate, and the graduate will receive a corresponding document on the specialty at the end of the educational programme.

## **2.2 Scientific method**

EP 7R01108 - "Endocrinology for adults, children", along with the mastery of clinical skills, provides for the involvement of residents throughout the entire period of training in the implementation of scientific activities that he performs under the guidance of a specially appointed mentor from among experienced doctors and under the supervision of the head of the residency, taking into account the personal interests of students. Involvement of residents for the implementation of small research projects carried out as part of the mastering of EP, develops the merits (qualities) of the researcher in students, teaches research methods and skills used in modern scientific practice. The implementation of these strategies is provided by a whole range of measures implemented within the framework of the classroom and extracurricular components of the EP when studying both mandatory and elective disciplines. Thus, the CED includes the discipline "Evidence-based medicine".

## **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

The content, scope and sequence of the courses of the EP of the residence in the specialties strictly correspond to the SCES. At the heart of the achievement of training objectives in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies that profile (PGE) the disciplines of the main component and the component of choice (CC). Clinical work of residents during training is carried out under the guidance of teachers, supervisors, clinical mentors. When forming the EP for the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children", the following factors were taken into account: the contribution of each discipline to the formation of competencies at a certain level (course), i.e. the responsibility of both specialized and related disciplines for the formation of a competent graduate, the definition of competencies in each discipline.

The educational programme of training of residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology of adults, children" is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines – 132 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, interim certification – 2 credits, final certification – 2 credits.

## **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2020 and is reflected in the standard curricula of the disciplines of the specialty. Specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" allows residents to plan and implement an individual, directed learning path during the entire training, preparing for work in the chosen specialty. Ensuring the guaranteed high quality of the educational process is determined by the quality of planning. The number of hours per two years of training is 4,200. With a two-year training programme, residents master 140 loans, 4 of which fall on CC – elective disciplines. The list of elective disciplines of the component is compiled according to the Catalogue of Elective Disciplines, which is formed and approved annually at the university. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with the mandatory disciplines are regulated by the SCES RoK. Thus, 4 loans were allocated for the MT and for the FSA. Total 132 credits are allocated for mastering the core disciplines (mandatory).

## **2.5 Organization of training**

The vice-rector for scientific and clinical work, who reports to the rector, is responsible for the strategy for the development of postgraduate education. The vice-rector responsible for the educational activities of the residency is the vice-rector for academic activities. Clinical bases are selected for compliance with the residency programme by the clinical work department, which draws up contracts with clinical bases (standard 6.).

Departments of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" headed by the head of the course determine the clinical bases, where the resident will be able to get access to patients in his profile of the educational programme of the residency. In accordance with the requirements of Order No.338 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of 13 July 2009 "On approval of the standard qualification characteristics of the positions of pedagogical workers and equivalent persons", when hiring candidates to fill pedagogical positions, it is mandatory to take into account the compliance of candidates with the qualification requirements.

## **2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care**

The presence of clinical bases in the largest multidisciplinary clinics and polyclinics of Almaty and the regions provides residents with the opportunity to master the process of patient management in outpatient settings, continuity between the primary and inpatient levels of care, interaction as part of a multidisciplinary team, assistance in emergency situations (standard 6). Patient supervision allows residents to master diagnostic and treatment procedures in the course of daily clinical activities. Multidisciplinary clinics have a broad profile of departments and emergency conditions, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies corresponding to the cycle of disciplines.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially -1.

*Standard 2: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

- 1) Introduce the fundamentals of the manager of scientific research into the educational programme.
- 2) Expand the list of elective disciplines in the specialty.

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

**Evidence of compliance:**

### **3.1 Methods of evaluation**

The general policy, principles, methods of assessment of residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" at the University are reflected in the following internal documents: Academic Policy of the University, Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students at the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", approved by the Academic Council dated 24.04.2020 No.1. The list of mandatory disciplines for the final control during the academic period is regulated by the completed disciplines, which are reflected in the WEP. The form of the midterm and final control is approved by the Academic Council. For testing, a technical specification is drawn up – a matrix of test tasks, which is reflected in the syllabuses. To ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the department / course has developed checklists for conducting current, milestone and final control of the discipline ( Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE, ).

### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training**

The assessment methods are fully comparable to the teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations. In the assessment of educational achievements, control and measurement tools developed by departments / courses are used, in various types (control questions, tasks in test form, tasks for laboratory work, practical and communication skills, etc.).

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in the NEI "KRMU" are defined in the syllabuses for the disciplines, which are discussed and approved at the departmental meetings, the CEP, the AC, the SC. The assessment criteria are announced in the first lesson for each discipline, and are also presented in the syllabus. Each stage (current, milestone and final control) allows you to assess the achievement of the final results of the resident's training. For a high-quality educational process, the EP in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" has vertical and horizontal integrations, so with vertical integration, continuity and interaction between all levels of study at the university – bachelor's degree, internship, residency are clearly visible, since the departments / courses

are engaged in teaching at all levels of education. Horizontal integration is carried out through training in organizations of different levels (standard 5, paragraph 5.1.1).

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria* of 11 standards: full - 9 partially – 2.

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:*

1) The organization's Committee of Testology to set up an analysis and evaluation of test tasks.

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and Selection Policy**

Admission to the residency in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" is carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No.600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to education in the organization of education, implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 " On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to study and training of medical personnel in the residency", the SCES and the Rules for admission to the residency of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for the current academic year of the residency EP assume a clinical focus of education and in-depth specialized training in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children". The conditions of admission of residents are described in detail in the "Rules of admission to the residency" for the relevant academic year, based on regulatory legal acts.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

According to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606 "On approval of the average ratio of the number of students to teachers to calculate the total number of faculty of higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations, with the exception of the Academy of Justice, military, special educational institutions, educational organizations in the field of culture", the number of residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" per teacher is 1:3. Questions about admission to residency educational programmes are posted on the university's website <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>. Documents on training, working curricula, syllabuses, requirements and to the educational process, acts, orders, etc. are posted on the website of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University".

#### **4.3 Resident support and advice**

To implement the competence-oriented Model of medical education in the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", the university operates a system of academic consulting of residents at the departments.

To this end, the resident is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, and assists in employment. The curator is appointed from among the faculty of the department (standard 2.1.7). In addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. Its function is to direct the resident to master the practical skills and competencies required by the resident in the process of his training, which is reflected in the Academic Policy of the University.

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

The quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the mission of the University and the EP, access to which is available through posting on the University's website.

Students together with the university teaching staff have a real opportunity to participate in the assessment of the specialty's EP during the direct discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of developing an individual work curriculum and elective disciplines (order for the composition of the CEP No. 26-02-15-n/k dated 28.08.2020)

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

According to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in the residency", resident doctors studying under a state educational order are paid a scholarship, in accordance with the Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships to students in educational institutions, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116.

Resident doctors are granted holidays between academic periods. The duration of holidays during the academic year is at least seven weeks, except for the final course, in accordance with the state compulsory standard of residency in medical specialties and the educational programme in the specialties of residency.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards: fully -30, partially – 1.

**Standard 4: Implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Expand the representation of resident associations and organizations in the process of admission of residents.

## **Standard 5: FACULTY**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The University pays great attention to the selection and recruitment of qualified personnel, as well as their training. The selection and recruitment of employees is carried out in accordance with the established requirements, taking into account basic and vocational education, as well as practical work experience, individual abilities, professional knowledge and other indicators. Analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of the teaching staff, monitoring and evaluation of pedagogical activities are the objects of constant attention on the part of the University management.

The University has approved the structure of departments. Order dated 26.08.2020 No. 26-02-14-n/k "On making changes to the organizational structure of the departments of KRMU.

The total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of the average ratio of students and teachers – 6:1; undergraduates and teachers – 6:1; residents and teachers – 3:1.

#### **5.2 Teachers' obligations and development**

The system of professional and pedagogical improvement of the teaching staff of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" includes the following units: the School of the teacher, the Institute of postgraduate education, winter and summer schools, which contribute to the formation and development of the competence and potential of the teaching staff.

The professional development programme, implemented in the university's IPE through retraining and advanced training courses, determines the number of students at the rate of 20% of the total number of teaching staff.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: full – 7.

**Standard 5: Implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.**

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The Administration of KazRosMedUniversity for continuous improvement of material and technical base from the budget of the university allocates necessary funds which are spent on: capital and current repairs, technical equipment of educational, scientific and information activity, acquisition of furniture and educational equipment, maintenance of engineering communications and networks of buildings and structures and registration of buildings and structures.

#### **6.2 Clinical Bases**

The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the high-quality organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient polyclinic care to the population of the region. The classrooms are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations, office equipment. For a number of years, the clinic has been carrying out gradual work aimed at solving the problems of ensuring the safety of patients, students, and medical staff of the institution.

Clinical bases have a sufficient bed capacity, the Department of Endocrinology – a sufficient number of classrooms for conducting practical classes of independent work of residents.

The number of training rooms and auxiliary rooms provided at clinical bases is 12,706.4 m<sup>2</sup>.

### **6.3 Information technology**

Information and communication technologies, including Internet resources, international databases of scientific and educational literature, electronic textbooks are actively used in the implementation of the educational programme on residency. The university has formed databases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the intranet of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle.

### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

The programme of training residents in the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology of adults, children" to work in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams. Working in multidisciplinary teams when choosing the tactics of managing the most complex patients increases the responsibility of residents when they see that performance depends on the correct organization of team work. In such situations, the resident performs all work within his competence.

### **6.5 Medical Research and Advances**

According to the strategy of the NEI "KRMU", since 2011, applied research works have been implemented by the faculty of departments/courses, students of the university through temporary scientific teams created for the implementation of research projects, the purpose of which was to increase the level of training of a future specialist at the university as a single educational and research and production complex, by forming the resident's basic research competencies necessary for future professional activity.

The main applied scientific direction of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversiteta" is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care through mobile complexes".

### **6.6 Education expertise**

The development of expertise in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education is ensured through the joint work of departments, department of academic work, CEP, AC.

Duties of examination in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education are assigned to the department of academic work, which also carries out the following functions:

Organization and maintenance of constant communication with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RC for HD of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the issues of educational and methodological work in the field of postgraduate, postgraduate and additional education.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

In order to organize and implement academic mobility, the University has organized a department of academic mobility, which actively works to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, pursues a policy for their implementation with educational institutions and

organizations of the Republic of Belarus, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Russian Federation, Turkey and France (annex 11).

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: fully -21.

*Standard 6: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.*

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multilevel approach is used, including the profiling /graduating and related departments, the residency department, the specialized CEP of postgraduate education, the AWD, Academic Council, Scientific Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students)).

#### **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

For feedback with teachers and residents, the Rector's blog is used, on which students and university staff receive answers to questions they are interested in on the terms of implementation of the educational programme. Representatives of residents are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in the discussion of the implementation of the educational programme.

In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of students and teachers and is systematic when making changes to the educational programme.

#### **7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates**

The Residence Department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring of appeals to the rector's blog, discussion of current issues in the social network. Monitoring student achievement of learning outcomes plays an important role in the assessment of EP.

#### **7.4 Stakeholder Engagement**

Representatives of the public – constant feedback in the form of questionnaires and interviews, participation in various events of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity". The programme evaluation process involves all stakeholders (faculty, residents, employers) through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is regulated by the University Charter, strategic plan, annual plans and reports of the University, as well as the relevant QMS procedures. The results of the assessment are heard at meetings of collegial bodies.

#### **7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes**

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" has developed mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes, providing for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows to monitor the process of implementation of EP and progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: full – 15.

*Standard 7: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Control**

Coordination of the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by the residency department under the supervision of the vice-rector for clinical activities. Students who have mastered the specialty 7R01108 –

"Endocrinology for adults, children" and successfully passed the state certification, are issued with a state-issued document on the qualification of a doctor in the specialty "endocrinologist".

### **8.2 Academic Leadership**

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" annually reviews and approves the Academic Policy, <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskaya-chestnost/> which regulates in detail the rights, duties and responsibilities of students and the University administration, the procedure for organizing the educational process. These rules stipulate the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The budget of KazRosMedUniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services (Attachment 13).

### **8.4 Administration and Management**

The University has defined the general strategy, main directions, priorities and objectives of the University's policy in the field of improving the quality of education in accordance with the University's mission, vision and strategic development plan. The calculation of the pedagogical load of the teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.499 dated May 20, 2013) and the state standard of education (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.387 dated July 29, 2009 and Order No.647 dated July 31, 2015) and is approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University.

### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

#### **the residency programme in cooperation with all interested parties.**

The mechanism of interaction of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", as a state medical higher education institution, with the authorized bodies (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the health sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the implementation of State programmes, Decrees and orders; contracts and agreements with health management bodies; contracts and agreements with health care organizations; written appeals of authorized state bodies and medical organizations.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: full – 15.

*Standard 8: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

## **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

On the basis of the analysis of reforming in the field of education and health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management, if necessary, the organizational structure of management is revised in the KRMU. An example of the process of continuous improvement, approaches to the implementation of the specialty 7R01108 – "Endocrinology of adults, children", is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the university for the development of advanced innovative technologies in medical practice and science, the use of advances in information and communication technologies, as well as the improvement of public health.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 4 standards: fully – 4.

*Standard 9: Implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

**6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children":**

1. Introduce the fundamentals of the manager of scientific research into the educational programme (standard 2)
2. Extend the list of elective disciplines by specialty (standard 2)
3. The organization's Committee of Testology to set up an analysis and evaluation of test tasks (standard 3)
4. Expand the representation of resident associations and organizations in the resident admission process (Standard 4).

**7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01108 – "Endocrinology for adults, children" with the accreditation standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 (five) years.

Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov
Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunosova Aigul Bitimbayevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich
Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai Utemuratovich
Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva
Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholuly

Observer for ECAQA M.A. Umarova



**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation			
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17			
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMME	30	28	2		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	9	2		
4.	STUDENTS	30	29	1		
5.	FACULTY	7	7			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	21			
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15			
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15			
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4			
	<b>Subtotal:</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>145</b>	<b>5</b>		
			<b>150</b>			

## List of documents studied by EEC members

<b>№</b>	<b>Name of the document</b>	<b>Identification number</b>	<b>Date of approval</b>
1	Personnel policy	R-01-23-01	25.12.2020
2	Regulations on social support for students	P-03-21-06	21.06.2019
3	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme	PL-03-36-08	26.08.2021
4	Regulation on the Test Committee	RB-03-18-04	28.10.2021
5	Rules for admission to the residency	PR-03-11-05	24.07.2020
6	Regulations on on-site training in internship and residency	PL-03-11-07	29.08.2019
7	Teacher Honor Code		12.12.2017
8	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the Use of Distance Education Technologies	PL-03-37-05	29.08.2019
9	Regulation on the Board of Curators	PL-03-21-08	18.11.2019
10	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	PL-03-35-10	29.08.2019
11	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	PL-03-35-11	29.08.2019
12	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	PR-03-35-12	29.08.2019
13	Code of Academic Integrity	K-03-36-05	27.04.2019
14	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	PR-03-36-08	29.08.2019
15	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	PL-03-17-06	29.08.2019
16	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University" system	PR-03-17-10	29.08.2019
17	Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students	PL-03-23-06	17.06.2019
18	Clinical Instructor Statement	PL-03-11-08	17.06.2019
19	Academic Policy	R-01-17-14	27.08.2021